

# **NORTH CAROLINA HUMAN TRAFFICKING COMMISSION**

## **Meeting Minutes**

**February 22, 2018**

**114 W. Edenton Street**

**Raleigh, NC 27609**

### **Commission Members Present**

Pamela Cashwell, NC Department of Public Safety  
Libby Coles, Justice Matters  
Jennifer Haigwood, NC Department of Labor  
Monika Johnston Hostler, NC Coalition Against Sexual Assault  
Jasmine McGhee, NC Department of Justice  
William M. Nichols, Ret. Major NC Highway Patrol  
Caitlin Ryland, Legal Aid of North Carolina  
Suzanne Mauney Smith, Gaston County Police  
Sarah Tellis, True Justice International  
William "Billy" West, Cumberland County District Attorney,  
NC Conference of District Attorneys

### **Members of the Public**

Sarah Harrison, NCCASA	Cindy Fraga Rizo, UNC
Elizabeth Hunter, Project FIGHT	Sandra Mertin, UNC
Katie Gonzalez, Salvation Army FIGHT	Michael Longmire, NC Massage Board
Kelly Gettle, ENC Stop HT	Erica Smith, Project FIGHT
Margaret Henderson, PNR-UNC-CH	Stephanie Stallings, Project Fight
Pam Strickland, ENC Stop HT	Nicole Bernard, Shield NC
Nancy Hagen, PNR	Brooke Burris, Lynch Foundation for Children
Jennie Vaughn, PNR	Kathy Nunez, Project FIGHT
Wanda Reives, PNR	Ashley R. Mitchell, Council for Women/Children
Ashley Burke, NC SBI	Michelle Scott, US DOJ
Charlene Reiss, DCRC	Kory Williford, FBI
Jesus Sandoval, Durham PD SVU	Keisha Ward, DCRC
Dominic Mussatie, Durham PD	Saira Estrada, NCC ADV
Ryann Harris, Public	Nathaniel Parker, NC DV Commission
Melissa Jerkins, PNR-UNC-CH	Greg Jenks, Garner UMC

## **NC Department of Justice Staff:**

Christine S. Long  
Ritu Kaur  
Susan Romano  
Narcisa Woods  
Megan Ray

## **Call to Order and Welcome**

The meeting was called to order at 10 a.m. by the Chairman Libby Coles.

## **Introductions**

All Commission Members and members of the public were given an opportunity to introduce themselves and the organizations they represent.

## **Approval of Minutes**

A motion was made to approve the minutes of the December 12, 2017 meetings. The motion was seconded and passed.

## **Cindy Frago Rizo, UNC-Chapel Hill, School of Social Work, and Sandra Martin, UNC-Chapel, Gillings School of Global Public Health**

Cindy Fraga Rizo and Sandy Martin gave an update (continued from prior meeting) on projects that are part of a collaborative MOU that the Commission has facilitated working with the GCC. Cindy spoke on school based trafficking programs 2016, which is funded by the Crime Victim Service Commission, and the Governor's Crime Commission. The initiative is called "Protect NC Youth Initiative." The initiative is in response to NC Bill 279, which mandates that schools have measures in place for training kids about sex trafficking, and also putting procedures and protocols into place to respond when a student victim has been identified, such measures will be in place. Partnering with NCCASA, materials and procedures that schools can use to meet the bill will be funneled into packages to distribute to schools.

Sandy Martin presented information regarding schooled-based trafficking programs for high risk youth 2017, such as alternative schools.

For the initiative an expert advisory team is being put together.

Cindy Frago Rizo and Sandra Martin engaged in a Q&A with Commission members and the public.

- When will the project be wrapped up?
  - October 2018 for the public schools, and October 2019 for alternative schools. We hope to have products to distribute by October 2018 for the public schools and October 2019 for alternative schools.
  
- When doing research were opportunities found that allowed you to crossover and to get involved with the prison system? Children are getting involved in criminal activity at a very young age, and could this be a stepping stone for educating them?
  - These juveniles are a high risk group and they may have had a trafficking experience before prison, and the team will certainly be looking into it.
  
- Can you share a little more about plans for piloting the program?
  - The team is still thinking through that phase and looking for funding to get into the schools. They are identifying schools that are interested, comparing their program to other programs, and doing some feasibility kind of work to implement in a couple of schools. It is critical to evaluate programs to see if they are working.
  
- Are there any opportunities for the commission to support financially in piloting the program?
  - We would love to talk with the Commission about that.
  
- When doing research did the team find anything on the demand side?
  - No
  
- How will you select experts in the area?
  - We will be inviting people, if you are interested please contact us.
  
- Are you looking at ways to integrate into what is already being taught and not introducing a complete new addition, or integrate to strengthen other programs such as sexual assault?
  - We are studying how to do this in a collaborative way and not competing with everything else that is being taught. Rather than a curriculum, we will have lesson plans and add-ons. Not just one course.
  
- Am I correct in understanding that you did one literature review that was looking for articles about generally looking for what is out there about domestic minor sex trafficking, and that the next step is looking for curricula that are already out there and whether or not they have been evaluated?
  - Yes, that is the next step.

**Rachel Parker, World Relief Triad, Anti-Human Trafficking Manager**

Rachel reviewed what World Relief Triad had done in 2017. The agency's Triad office has been a refugee resettlement agency since 2004, but now they already have programs already structured in their services that the government identifies as the next steps.

Rachel noted that as survivors are identified by law enforcement, they will receive continued presence. The match grant program is a rapid case management and employment program. They can now serve victims for one day or as long as one year.

#### Questions and Answers

- Is it a 50% shortage on law enforcement that you are hearing?
  - I heard that one particular law enforcement agency was significantly down, and was looking at sacrificing some integral components of their staff just to have manpower.

#### **Chair Report and Action Items, Libby Coles**

Chairman Coles said that she was planning on bringing the Commission's MOU with Polaris up to vote at the meeting, however she had just received it. She indicated that she would circulate the information via e-mail so that the Commission members could review it and would bring the MOU up for vote at the April 26, 2018 meeting. Chair Coles reminded the Commissioners that the Commission signed on to the MOU with Polaris about a year ago, and language was included that the Commission would review after a year and re-discuss the MOU and potentially re-sign.

Chair Coles shared that she wanted to circulate the report that she had sent from DHHS to the Joint Legislative Oversight Committee on Justice and Public Safety, the Committee on DHHS, the Commission and the Governor, because Michael Becketts, the Assistant Secretary for the Department of Health and Human Services would be speaking later in the meeting.

#### **Christine Shaw Long, Human Trafficking Commission Coordinator**

Christine discussed projects that the HTC office is now working on:

- Development of new website which will be more extensive than the current one
- Creating a spreadsheet of service providers
- Discussing a hotline
- Victim's Discretionary Training Grant
  - Registration is scheduled to go live online on Monday
  - Will be two separate links, one for law enforcement, and those participants who do not need credit. The second link will be for participants who need credit.
- The GCC grant cycle just ended and the HTC has applied for a renewal/extension grant

She will be continuing to serve on advisory and committee steering groups that she has been previously serving on and will give future updates.

## NC DOJ and Action Items, Jasmine McGhee

- In 2017 the legislature enacted a posting requirement in all establishments licensed by the ABC Board. The job to develop and distribute the posters was given to the HTC. The DOJ has been working hard to provide support. When the law was passed it had a line item in the budget for the HTC and DOJ to produce the posters so it was not an unfunded mandate.

### Distribution

- When the posters are distributed, a brief letter from the DOJ and HTC regarding the purpose of the sign will accompany the poster. An audit (not a full audit) will need to be done to determine the level of compliance regarding the sign in the establishments. The Commission is open to ideas regarding how to measure the effectiveness of the distribution and actual usage of the posters.
- Through the DOC, the posters will be distributed to 100 Job Link centers in NC.
- The Department of Transportation, some of their subgroups will distribute the signs in a number of different areas totaling 734 signs:
  - Welcome centers
  - Rest areas
  - Transportation stations
- The signs will be distributed by direct mail to 125 emergency rooms.
- There are 19,000 establishments licensed by the ABC Commission, and we are in the process of getting quotes from vendors to mail the posters individually. The worst case scenario will be Brian Erwin and ALE agents will do individual distributions which will take a long while.
- Adult establishments have been a little harder to track, but we have a spread sheet identifying those establishments and we will be doing an individual distribution. Establishments declared to be a public nuisance are difficult to locate because new ones are always popping up and others shutting down; always a moving target.

### The Poster

- The posters are in English only but we plan to provide other translations and make them available electronically, and we will have to discuss a distribution plan. They will be made available on the website to the public, and can be downloaded for posting additional places as well. Once the sign is provided in multiple languages, how do we figure out how to tell people what to put where. Can we depend on

people to put it up in multiple languages or will they use that in a way to be deceiving. We are interested in folks' thoughts on that. We want to continue to be as accessible as possible and thinking about the communities that we are hoping to serve, so our ears are still open.

- The design and creation is the result of input from a lot of different people weighing in on this, and it is reflective of many different agencies.
- Chair Coles discussed what factors were considered when designing the poster
  - She explained that the poster will be on the wall with a lot of different posters, so it needed to be something as eye catching as possible. It needed to be so that someone could easily read and comprehend in just three seconds when walking by the poster.
  - The Commission wanted to cast a broad net because they wanted more people to call the hotline; more individuals who are not victims of human trafficking, and not those who are opting out.

#### Questions and Answers

- Who is distributing the poster to the adult establishments?
  - The Commission will distribute them.
- Posters are not currently required to be posted in migrant labor camps, but there are several thousand around North Carolina. I was wondering if maybe the DOL would consider making posting of the poster in English and Spanish through the Goldstar program.
  - That is certainly a conversation that would could have with them, but we would not be in a position to do that at all.
- Are we able to produce our own copies and distribute where we feel like they need to go in our local neighborhood?
  - Yes, it will be on the website so it can be downloaded.

#### **Jasmine McGhee, Commission Member – NCCASA Contract**

Commissioner McGhee told Commission members who were on the Commission last year that they may recall we entered into a contract with NCCASA to provide consulting services and assist Ritu with the first training in Raleigh. It went very well and we would like to retain them again for the New Bern training on April 9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup>.

In an abundance of caution we wanted to give the Commission an opportunity to discuss and vote on retaining NCCASA again, given that a member of the Commission

is the Executive Director of NCCASA. She is not working directly on the contract; members of her training team are. The contract has already been through internal DOJ review in terms of our Financial Services and we're good to go, but wanted to go through this process in an abundance of caution.

Chair Cole asked if there were any questions or concerns

- Is it a renewal?
  - The contract is essentially identical to the previous one that was signed. There are a few changes in regards to the immeasurables that will be required for NCCASA to be able to do its work but the dollar amount is the same, \$5000, but that is the FE. The hourly rate that is allowed under GCC contract is \$81.00, and that is certainly a blended rate because they are providing services that are worth much more than that.
  
- Is it a sole source contract?
  - Yes, and that was allowed giving the dollar amount which is below the amount that you need to put out for a bid.

Commissioner McGhee moved that the commission approve the contract. The motion was seconded and carried.

Commissioner Tellis asked for an edit to the minutes. She, not Tracy Klein was present at the December meeting. The minutes were revised to reflect the change after a vote.

### **Ben Thompson, Legal Counsel to the NC Board of Massage and Bodywork Therapy**

Mr. Thompson gave an update on the massage board's new scope of authority and their anti-trafficking efforts. He also spoke about the history of the board and what they do.

- The Massage Board's purposes are vastly different than the HTC's, but going forward they can talk about how they can work together to accomplish some of the same goals.
  
- Senate Bill 548 deals with human trafficking and added a felony class.
  - The bill allows the massage board to regulate establishments.
  - The Act is to protect the public and allows for criminal record checks for establishment owners.

- The owner must have proof of good moral character
- The Board may conduct inspections, and require the establishment to post anti-human trafficking poster.
- The Board is getting more involved in the criminal process with establishments
  - Michael Longmire has started investigating establishments for the Board. He is currently tracking about 15 criminal cases, with either three or four of those cases involving human trafficking.

#### Questions, Answers and Comments

##### Commissioner Nichols –

- Does the act close all of the loopholes that the Board was seeing? Is it moving in the right direction and addressing the problems from last year.

##### Ben Thompson –

- I think it has closed the loopholes. The biggest problem is that we have no control over someone who is not licensed. We can send cease and desist letters and threaten, but we have no teeth unless in court.

##### Commissioner Nichols

- I think we have seen a lot of progress in the last year or so. Law enforcement has come on board to do the interventions, but they have manpower shortages and need to reallocate their resources. It is difficult to get them to focus on the massage business when they have what they perceive, helping community, might be bigger issues. Law enforcement needs help to understand the more serious problems of human trafficking in what appears to be a vice. They need to know how to help potential victims – they can round them up, but unless there is some way to help them the cycle just continues. That is where the commission comes in, working with law enforcement

##### Commissioner Ryland

- The legal aid of NC would love to receive a referral for our services. We are there to consult, prepare materials related to one of the instances in a language most likely to be understood by the victims if they have a little hears up. There is no

requirement for posters to be in understandable languages, and I would encourage it to the board.

Commissioner McGhee -

When updates and decisions are made please update the DOJ and Commission, and we will be happy to provide the sign. As Caitlyn said, it is at the discretion of the board.

Commissioner West -

- I would like to compliment you and your group coming from the prosecutors across the state. I have seen the loopholes played out before this legislation, it was difficult to prosecute some of the cases. This was an important bill and a lot of our HT, at least in Cumberland County, operates through these massage parlors, so I just applaud you and your organization and the commission for getting the word out about massage parlors and the potential problems that they present.

Chair Coles -

- I reached out to Charles to sit down for a meeting. I am particularly concerned about victims slipping through the cracks where they are the ones who are potentially practicing without a license, or who does not speak English. So, what is your approach and strategy? Are you taking in situation where the victim might have a criminal or civil record?

Ben Thompson -

- As far as the Board is concerned, of course we have no authority over someone who has no license. So, if there are victims in the establishments and they are practicing without a license they are not going to be coming before our Board because of that. All the board can do currently is to go to civil court and seek an injunction against them for practicing without a license, but if there is any indication they are a victims the board has no need or desire to do that. There is a need to talk to law enforcement and make sure that are prosecuting the people in charge who are forcing the woman to do that.

Chair Coles -

- During that conversation there is some planning that can be made for proper training and identification of victims.

Commissioner Tellis -

- I've heard you say that education is lacking and think a lot of non-profits present would be will to provide that education. I believe that Restore NYC specializes in massage parlor survivors with Chinese backgrounds in particular, and they are planning on coming here and doing some education with one of the non-profits, so maybe we can keep in the loop on that. Most of the time they can create the training that will satisfy your time constraints.

Chair Coles -

- Go ahead and make a formal time request for that agenda and if that works schedule, and we'll make sure that someone can show up to speak to the board.

Ben Thompson -

- The next board meeting is April 19<sup>th</sup>

### **Michael Becketts, Assistant DHHS Secretary**

Mr. Becketts gave an overview on the agency's work against HT:

2017 – Worked with Project No Rest to put on the first statewide conference on HT

2018 – As required by the legislature, the feasibility study for training 1<sup>st</sup> responders about HT. The feasibility study required us to determine the feasibility of training 157,000 professionals needing training excluding law enforcement. Training should emphasize a multidiscipline approach to training and working with issues relating to HT.

Questions and Remarks

Commissioner Nichols -

- It is interesting, and congrats to see someone that's been on the front lines get elevated to the position that you are and that you can actually implement the programs. We are very happy you are there.

Commissioner Johnston Hostler -

- I do agree you did a great job. I think it's my duty to kind of talk about ....that we have actually looked at policy and you all have done the legwork, and saying here is what we've done here or discovered.
- I guess the question that I've always asked and remind folks in my office is that it's one thing to legislate and put something in policy, but it's a whole culture shift to actually see it come into play across the state of NC. This is a big task to actually see this. How much of this do you see being a part of you all changing the culture and attitudes of folks who work from this side of the things or implementation because that is really feasible more so.

Michael Becketts

- One of the things that I think is really helpful in order to change the culture is that we really need to work on changing paradigms in people's thinking about this and HT, especially sex trafficking becomes a much more sensitive issue. I think it's easier on someone to talk about labor trafficking that it is to talk about sex trafficking, and one of the things that is really important to me is that this is not just policy changes. As some of you may know, NC's child welfare system is under a program plan to improve some of the things that we do and how we do it with some of our county DSS's and one of the things that we are required to do is shift our technical assistance model. Right now it is more like a help desk juncture. What we are required to do is really go into counties and work with them differently, so that we are teaching, mentoring and coaching, and that is a lot different approach. We are moving toward a more data driven sort of work and we would hope that as we see upticks in particular counties that we could address the growth that they are doing a better job to identify. But now we have to ask are they doing the right work to serve and we should be looking as we continue the continuous quality and improvement.

House Bill 630 is actually going to be dividing the state into regions where we are proposing state offices to provide supervision and support to a smaller number of counties.

Commissioner Cashwell -

- Did the feasibility study look at the practical side of how you actually train that many people because it is a lot of people to receive training? I feel like often we have these grand ideas and you even figure out this is necessary this is what it should look like for these people that we need to train, but when it's time for boots on the ground to actually do it, it's like oh my God, we don't have the resources to do this.

Michael Becketts -

- That is where we are, so we've said how many people now, where are the resources going to come from to do this?

Chair Coles -

- I did note that recommendation one the commission should be in collaboration with the DHHS form an advisory group of subject matter experts to explore and evaluate anti-human trafficking training curricula, models and screening tools. I just want to open it up for discussion among the commission and your thoughts and comments on moving it forward with the commission.

Well, I would propose that we move forward to go ahead and implement that recommendation. Motion was made, seconded and carried unanimously.

- The commission has the next phase of our work cut out for us and look forward to working with you, Secretary Cohen, and your fabulous team going forward. I want to thank Will Ray who is here, for his work on the feasibility study, and Aaron Connor and Nicole Cole. Those were the three folks that I communicated with, and I am sure there were others who did phenomenal work.

Public Questions

Charlene Creiss -

- About the non-caretaker referral – is that if the trafficker is not the primary caretaker then DSS can take possession and can have the jurisdiction?

Michael Becketts -

- Yes, the Children's Bureau has given us the go ahead to say that our statutory changes put us in compliance with Federal requirements, and so this policy very specifically will provide the guidance necessary for specific counties, for them to

receive reports for children where the care-taker is the alleged perp and where this is an issue of human trafficking.

Pam Strickland –

- You keep using the word guidance, so I guess my concern is when you talk about the

intake process, and the screening process that will send guidance down. The counties are not required to keep that guidance.

Michael Becketts -

- There is a difference in policy and those things that are required, guidance on what happens at the county level, and how they go about implementing certain things. But, policy is policy and they are required to follow policy. The new intake questions are policy. Our manual is available on our public website.

## **Committee Reports**

Commissioner Haigwood -

- The short session is coming up on May 16, and as Libby mentioned some legislative recommendations for the short session have been received. The committee is working though those recommendations, and is also working on getting an e-mail out to stakeholders requesting additional recommendations with the goal of getting those back by mid-March.

Commissioner Johnston Hostler -

- Sarah Harrison from the NCCASA office has been working on the Doodle Poll to set the first actual meeting in March for the Vetting and Standards Committee meeting. She thanked those who have sent documentation which Sarah has been sifting through and trying to consolidate what they are trying to bring forward to the committee when they meet. A small group of people representing all of the groups who generally attend was invited, but the HTC is a public body and every meeting is open like all HTC meetings, and just because you did not get a call does not mean that you cannot attend and participate.

## **Public Comments**

Pam Strickland

Reminded everybody that NCCAHT meets quarterly, and the next meeting is May 3, 2018. Everyone is invited to attend.

Hailey Simms

Hailey is an intern for PATH NC. As part of her internship, she is doing a 15 hour project that will be a four part webinar series through Facebook Live. She is focusing on opportunities within the foster care system, and how those risk factors can lead to human trafficking.

## **Commission Comments**

Commissioner Nichols -

- In listening to these presentations it sounds like it is hard for the victims to establish and identification once they become a victim. We wanted to get someone back in place from the DMV that we actually had contact with and they did appoint a commission. Torre Jessup is the new Commissioner at the DMV, and Scott Parker is the Deputy Commissioner. We can bring the Commissioner in and let him appoint someone to work with you all in the field and try to help these victims. Would be a good advocate to put in touch with the right ones to help establish identity. As a Commission we are here to help you.

Chair Coles adjourned the meeting.

